

**THE PROSECUTORS AND THE PEOPLES OF THE
ASIA-PACIFIC REGION**

v.

**HIROHITO EMPEROR SHOWA
ANDO Rikichi,
HATA Shunroku,
ITAGAKI Seishiro,
KOBAYASHI Seizo,
MATSUI Iwane,
UMEZU Yoshijiro,
TERAUCHI Hisaichi,
TOJO Hideki,
YAMASHITA Tomoyuki
and
THE GOVERNMENT OF JAPAN**

JUDGEMENT

**Before: Judge Gabrielle Kirk McDonald, Presiding
Judge Carmen Argibay
Judge Christine Chinkin
Judge Willy Mutunga**

**Delivered: 4 December 2001
The Hague, The Netherlands**



**THE WOMEN'S INTERNATIONAL
WAR CRIMES TRIBUNAL**

**THE PROSECUTORS AND THE PEOPLES OF THE
ASIA-PACIFIC REGION**

v.

HIROHITO EMPEROR SHOWA

**ANDO Rikichi,
HATA Shunroku,
ITAGAKI Seishiro,
KOBAYASHI Seizo,
MATSUI Iwane,
UMEZU Yoshijiro,
TERAUCHI Hisaichi,
TOJO Hideki,
YAMASHITA Tomoyuki**

and

THE GOVERNMENT OF JAPAN

JUDGEMENT

**Before: Judge Gabrielle Kirk McDonald, Presiding
Judge Carmen Argibay
Judge Christine Chinkin
Judge Willy Mutunga**

**Delivered: 4 December 2001
The Hague, The Netherlands**



**THE WOMEN'S INTERNATIONAL
WAR CRIMES TRIBUNAL**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
PART I – INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND OF THE PROCEEDINGS.....	1
A. Breaking the History of Silence	1
B. Organisation of the Tribunal	3
C. The Charter	3
D. The Common Indictment and the Application Regarding State Responsibility	4
E. Standard of Proof	6
F. The Accused	7
G. Notice to Japan and Process for Consideration of Defences.....	8
H. The Proceedings.....	9
I. The Potential Arguments of the Accused and the Japanese Government	10
1. Arguments Concerning Criminal Responsibility Under the Common Indictment.....	10
(a) Lack of Jurisdiction	10
(b) Denial of Due Process	10
(c) Non-Applicability of the Laws of War to the Annexed Territories.....	11
(d) Violation of the Non-Retroactivity Principle — <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i>	11
(e) Violation of Double Jeopardy.....	12
(f) Lack of Criminal Responsibility of Commanders or Other Superiors	12
(g) Non-Coerciveness of the “Comfort System”	12
(h) Immunity of Emperor HIROHITO	12
2. Arguments Concerning State Responsibility: The Application for Restitution and Reparations	13
(a) Statute of Limitations	13
(b) No Individual Standing to Claim Reparations	13

(c)	Individual Claims Settled by the Peace Treaties	13
J.	The Legal and Moral Basis of the Women's International War Crimes Tribunal	14
1.	The History of Peoples' Tribunals	14
2.	The Multilateral Nature of International Human Rights Law: Obligations Owed <i>Erga Omnes</i>	18
K.	The Tokyo Tribunal as a Continuation of the IMTFE	19
L.	The Inapplicability of Amnesty	20
PART II – FACTUAL FINDINGS		22
A.	Description of the Evidence Received	22
B.	The Testimony of the Survivors	22
C.	Documentary Evidence Regarding the Role of Japan or the Accused in Establishing and Maintaining the “Comfort System”	23
1.	The Recruitment Memo and Taiwan Army Telegram No. 602	23
2.	Allied Reports	26
D.	Declarations and Admissions of the State of Japan	29
E.	The History of the Japanese Military Aggression in the Asia-Pacific Region	31
1.	Crimes Common to the Japanese Aggression Throughout the Asia-Pacific	31
2.	Taiwan	33
3.	Korea	34
4.	China	34
5.	The Philippines	36
6.	Malaysia	37
7.	Indonesia	37
8.	The Dutch Territories	38
9.	East Timor	38
10.	Conclusion	39

F.	Development and Operation of the “Comfort Women” System	39
1.	The Origins of the Sexual Slavery System: The Rape of Nanking and Related Atrocities	39
(a)	The First “Comfort” Stations	39
(b)	The Rape of Nanking	41
2.	Institutionalisation of the Sexual Slavery System	43
(a)	Sexual Enslavement in China and of Chinese Girls and Women	43
(b)	Sexual Enslavement of Taiwanese Girls and Women	49
(c)	Sexual Enslavement of Korean Girls and Women	52
(d)	Sexual Enslavement in the Philippines and of Filipina Girls and Women	59
(e)	Sexual Enslavement in Malaysia and of Malaysian Girls and Women	62
(f)	Sexual Enslavement in Indonesia and of Indonesian Girls and Women	64
(g)	Sexual Enslavement in Dutch Territories and of Dutch Girls and Women	66
(h)	Sexual Enslavement in East Timor and of East Timorese Girls and Women	67
(i)	Sexual Slavery of Japanese Girls and Women	69
G.	Characteristics of the Military Sexual Slavery System	71
1.	Military Control and Regulation of the “Comfort Women” System	71
2.	Who Were the “Comfort Women”?	73
3.	Acquisition or Procurement of “Comfort Women”	74
(a)	Methods of Procurement	74
(b)	Agents of Procurement	77
(c)	Assignment & Transport	77
(d)	Experiences upon Arrival at the “Comfort Stations”	78

4.	Conditions of the Facilities.....	79
(a)	Types of Sexual Slavery Facilities.....	79
(b)	General Living Conditions in the Sexual Slavery Facilities.....	80
5.	Physical and Mental Violence.....	81
(a)	Relentless Rape and Accompanying Violence.....	81
(b)	Illnesses and Deteriorating Health.....	84
(c)	Forced Medical Examinations and Mistreatment.....	85
6.	The Facade of Prostitution.....	86
7.	Control over Movement.....	87
8.	Isolation and Separation from Families.....	88
9.	Sexual Slavery Accompanied by Additional Forms of Forced Labour.....	88
10.	Treatment as Property and Objects.....	88
11.	Abandonment after the War – Attempts to Return Home and Reintegrate into Society.....	89
12.	Conclusion.....	91
H.	The Rapes at Mapanique.....	91
I.	Continuing Harm to Survivors of Rape and Sexual Slavery.....	96
1.	Enduring Health Damages and Physical Suffering.....	96
2.	Reproductive Harms.....	97
3.	Ongoing Psychological Harms.....	98
4.	Impediments to Intimate Relationships and Social/ Community Life.....	100
5.	Silence.....	102
6.	Poverty and Social/Economic Hardship.....	103
J.	The Expert Testimony Regarding the Impact of Sexual Slavery.....	104
K.	Demands for Reparations.....	106

PART III – APPLICABLE LAW.....	109
A. Preliminary Legal Issues.....	109
1. Principles of Criminal Law.....	109
(a) The Principle of Legality: <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Lege</i>	109
(b) Due Process.....	110
(c) Statute of Limitations.....	111
(d) Double Jeopardy – <i>Non Bis in Idem</i>	112
(e) Head of State/Official Immunity.....	113
B. The Substantive Crimes Charged: Rape and Sexual Slavery as Crimes Against Humanity.....	116
1. Introduction.....	116
2. Crimes Against Humanity: Principle of Legality and Threshold Conditions.....	117
(a) Origins of Crimes Against Humanity and Development in International Law Prior to 1937.....	117
(b) Precedents for the Concept of Crimes Against Humanity.....	117
(c) Connection to War Crimes and Other International Crimes.....	119
(d) The World War II Tribunals' Treatment of Crimes Against Humanity.....	120
(e) Threshold Conditions of Applicability.....	122
(f) Application of the Threshold Conditions of Crimes Against Humanity to the Facts.....	124
3. Rape as a Crime Against Humanity.....	126
(a) Introduction.....	126
(b) Origins of Rape as a War Crime.....	126
(c) Rape and Other Forms of Sexual Violence in the Post-War Trials.....	129
(i) The IMTFE Proceedings.....	130
(ii) The Nuremberg Proceedings.....	134

(d)	Post-War Developments	136
4.	International Law Regarding Slavery and Sexual Slavery	138
(a)	Introduction	138
(b)	The Historical Development of International Law Prohibiting Slavery	139
(i)	Slavery as an International Crime	139
(ii)	Forced Labour as a War Crime	140
(iii)	ILO Convention Concerning Forced Labour	141
(iv)	The Suppression of Trafficking	142
(v)	[En]forced Prostitution as a War Crime	143
(c)	Post-War Jurisprudence	144
(d)	The Crime of Sexual Slavery	145
(i)	Concepts of Chattel Slavery and Forced Labour	146
(ii)	Essential Elements of Sexual Slavery	146
(iii)	Recent Approaches to Sexual Slavery	147
(iv)	Sexual Slavery v. Forced Prostitution: Correcting the Legal (Mis)Characterisation	150
(e)	Indicia of Sexual Slavery and Their Application to the "Comfort System"	152
(i)	Introduction	152
(ii)	Involuntary Procurement	152
(iii)	Treatment as Disposable Property	153
(iv)	Restriction of Fundamental Rights and Basic Liberties	153
(v)	Absence of Consent or of Conditions Under Which Consent Is Possible	155
(vi)	Forced Labour	155
(vii)	Discriminatory Treatment	157

5.	Findings as to Rape and Sexual Slavery in the Context of the "Comfort System" (Counts 1-2)	157
6.	Findings as to Rape in the Context of Mapanique (Count 3)	158
	PART IV - INDIVIDUAL CRIMINAL RESPONSIBILITY	160
A.	Introduction: Relevant Provisions	160
B.	Article 3(2) – Responsibility of a Commander or Other Superior	161
1.	General Standard	162
2.	Superior-Subordinate Relationship	163
3.	The Accused "Knew or Had Reason to Know" that Crimes Were Being Committed	166
(a)	Actual Knowledge	168
(b)	"Had Reason to Know"	170
4.	Failure to Take Necessary and Reasonable Measures	173
C.	Article 3(1): Individual Responsibility for Planning, Instigating, Ordering, Aiding or Abetting Crimes	175
1.	Ordering, Planning, and Instigating	176
2.	Aiding and Abetting	177
(a)	Aiding: <i>Actus Reus</i>	178
(b)	Abetting: <i>Actus Reus</i>	179
(c)	Aiding and Abetting: <i>Mens Rea</i>	180
	PART V – LEGAL FINDINGS AND VERDICTS	182
A.	Introduction: Summary of the Charges and Evidence Received	182
B.	Counts 1 and 2 of the Common Indictment	184
1.	Rape and Sexual Slavery in the "Comfort System" as Crimes Against Humanity	184
(a)	Summary of Findings Relevant to the Assessment of Criminal Responsibility of the Accused	184

(b)	Assessment of Criminal Responsibility of the Accused	189
(i)	Bases for Determining Criminal Responsibility of the Accused	189
(ii)	The Positions Held by the Accused	190
(c)	Consideration of Exceptional Circumstances and Additional Evidence as to Emperor HIROHITO and General MATSUI	192
(i)	Findings with Regard to Emperor HIROHITO's Superior and Individual Responsibility for Rape and Sexual Slavery Committed as a Consequence of the "Comfort Women System"	193
(ii)	Findings with Regard to MATSUI's Command and Individual Responsibility for Rape and Sexual Slavery Committed as a Consequence of the "Comfort Women System"	196
C.	Count 3 of the Common Indictment	200
1.	Rapes in Mapanique	200
(a)	Findings with Respect to Emperor HIROHITO's Superior and Individual Responsibility for the Rapes at Mapanique	201
(b)	Findings with Respect to YAMASHITA's Superior and Individual Responsibility for the Rapes at Mapanique	202
D.	Verdicts	204
PART VI – STATE RESPONSIBILITY		205
INTRODUCTION		205
A.	Preliminary Legal Issues	206
1.	The Standing of the Applicants	206
2.	The Legal Significance of Delay in Bringing the Application	207
3.	Exhaustion of Domestic Remedies	208
4.	Standard of Responsibility	209

B.	Elements of State Responsibility	210
1.	The Applicable Principles of Law	210
2.	Applicability to Colonial and Occupied Territories	212
(a)	The Status of Taiwan	212
(b)	The Status of Korea	213
3.	The Position of the Japanese, Korean and Taiwanese Claims Under International Law	213
C.	Japan's Initial Violations of Treaty and Customary Law	213
1.	The 1907 Hague Convention Respecting the Laws and Customs of War on Land	214
2.	The 1921 International Convention for the Suppression of the Traffic in Women and Children	215
3.	1929 Geneva Convention	215
4.	1930 International Labour Organization Convention Concerning Forced Labour	216
5.	Enslavement and Sexual Slavery	216
6.	Non-Discrimination Norms	216
D.	Attributability of Internationally Wrongful Acts to the State of Japan	217
1.	State Responsibility for Acts of State Organs	217
2.	Extra-Territorial Theory of Responsibility	219
E.	Continuing Obligations and Violations of State Responsibility	219
1.	Denial, Concealment, and Distortion	220
(a)	Destruction and Concealment of Documents in the Immediate Aftermath of the War	220
(b)	Continuing Concealment of Documents	222
(c)	Continuing Denial and Failure to Fully Disclose the Truth	223
2.	Failure to Prosecute and Punish Those Criminally Responsible	225

3.	Failure to Provide Reparations	227
(a)	Continuing Failure to Make a Full and Genuine Apology	227
(b)	Continuing Failure to Make Official and Fair Compensation	230
(c)	Continuing Opposition to Formal Claims for Reparations Initiated by Survivors	232
(i)	Opposition to Court Cases	232
(ii)	Opposition to the Reports of the International Labour Organisation (ILO) Committee of Experts	234
(iii)	Opposition to the Reports of UN Special Rapporteurs	235
4.	Failure to Take Measures to Protect the Integrity, Well-being and Dignity of the Human Person	236
(a)	Abandonment of Women Post-War	236
(b)	Continuing Failure to Repudiate Denials of Coercion by High-Ranking Government Officials	236
5.	Discrimination	237
6.	The State, Militarism and Gender	239
7.	Failure to Take Necessary Measures to Prevent Recurrence: History Textbooks	241
8.	Contemporary State and International Practice Relating to Continuing Legal Responsibility	242
F.	Defences to State Responsibility: The Peace Treaties	243
1.	The Impact of the Treaties on the Settlement of Claims	243
(a)	The San Francisco Peace Treaty	244
(b)	Treaty of Peace Between Japan and Taiwan	245
(c)	Treaty of Peace and Friendship Between Japan and China	245
(d)	Settlement Between Netherlands and Japan	245
(e)	Reparations Agreement Between the Philippines and Japan	246

(f)	Treaty on Basic Relations Between Japan and the Republic of Korea	246
2.	The Issue of the Peace Treaties' Waiver of Individual Claims	247
(a)	Waiver as to Crimes Against Humanity	247
(b)	Waiver as to Claims Not Presented	248
(c)	Waiver as to Victim States Not Participating	248
(d)	Waiver and the Principle of Obligation <i>Erga Omnes</i>	249
3.	Treaties Not an Articulation of the Traditional Doctrine of Diplomatic Protection	250
4.	The Peace Treaties as Political Rather Than Legal Settlements	250
5.	Changed Circumstances	251
6.	The Gendered Nature of the Peace Treaties	252
7.	Article 3 of the 1907 Hague Convention	252
G.	Conclusion	253
PART VII – REPARATIONS		254
A.	Introduction	254
1.	Satisfaction	256
2.	Official and Full Acknowledgement	257
3.	Preservation of Memory	258
4.	Gender Training, Empowerment, and Equality	258
5.	Access to Judicial Redress	258
6.	Restitution	259
7.	Compensation	259
8.	Rehabilitation	260
B.	Recommendations	262
PART VIII – CONCLUSION		264

APPENDICES

Appendix A: Charter

Appendix B: Common Indictment

Appendix C: Application for Restitution and Reparations

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

OFFICE OF THE PROSECUTORCHIEF PROSECUTORS

Patricia Viseur Sellers

Ustinia Dolgopol

COUNTRY PROSECUTORSChina

Zhou Hong-Jun

Kang Jian

Gong Bai Hua

Guan Jian Qiang

East Timor

Carmelita Caetano Moniz

Maria Natercia Gusmao

Indonesia

Nursyahbhani

Katjasungkana

Antarini Arna

Asnifriyanti Damanik

Paulus R. Mahulette

Japan

Kawaguchi Kazuko

Yokota Yuichi

Higashizawa Yasushi

Omori Noriko

Abe Koki

Shin Hae Bong

The Netherlands

Grant Niemann

Michelle Jarvis

North Korea

Jong Nam Young

Hwang Ho Nam

South Korea

Kim Myung-gi

Cho Si Hyun

Kim Chang Rok

Chang Wan-Ick

Park Won-Soon

Kang Jeong-Sook

Ha Jong-Moon

Yang Hyun-ah

Malaysia

Juliette Chinaud

The Philippines

Merlin Magallona

Sedrey Candelaria

Eleanor C. Conda

Aurora Javate de Dios

Ricardo Jose

Purificacion Quisumbing

Evalyn Ursua

Taiwan

Chuang Kuo-Ming

Liao Ying-Chih

Lu Chia Hsiang

Hwang Jua-Yuan

Chiang Huang-Chih

Yu Mei-Nu

ANTICIPATED ARGUMENTS OF THE DEFENCE
PRESENTED BY AMICUS CURIAE INVITED BY THE COURT

Imamura Tsuguo

THE REGISTRY

Rowena V. Guezon

Susan Macabuag